

September 27, 2006

To United States Senators and Members of Congress

Dear Senators and Representatives:

We, the undersigned law deans and professors, write in our individual capacity to express our deep concern about two bills that are rapidly moving through Congress. These bills, the Military Commissions Act and the National Security Surveillance Act, would make the indefinite detention of those labeled enemy combatants and the executive's program of domestic surveillance effectively unreviewable by any independent judge sitting in public session. While different in character, both bills unwisely contract the jurisdiction of courts and deprive them of the ability to decide critical issues that must be subject to judicial review in any free and democratic society.

Although the Military Commissions Act of 2006 (S. 3929/S. 3930) was drafted to improve and codify military commission procedures following the Supreme Court's June 2006 decision in *Hamdan v. Rumsfeld*, it summarily eliminates the right of habeas corpus for those detained by the U.S. government who have been or may be deemed to be enemy combatants.¹ Detainees will have no ability to challenge the conditions of their detention in court unless and until the administration decides to try them before a military commission. Those who are not tried will have no recourse to any independent court at any time. Enacting this provision into law would be a grievous error. As several witnesses testified before the Senate Judiciary Committee on Monday, Article I, Section 9 of the Constitution specifies that "[t]he Privilege of the Writ of Habeas Corpus shall not be suspended, unless when in Cases of Rebellion or Invasion the public Safety may require it," conditions that are plainly not satisfied here.

Similarly, the National Security Surveillance Act of 2006 (S. 3876) would strip courts of jurisdiction over pending cases challenging the legality of the administration's domestic spying program and would transfer these cases to the court established by the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act of 1978 (FISA).² The transfer of these cases to a secret court that issues secret

¹ Section 6 would replace subsection (e) of Section 2241 of Title 28 of the United States Code with the following: "(e)(1) No court, justice, or judge shall have jurisdiction to hear or consider an application for a writ of habeas corpus filed by or on behalf of an alien detained by the United States who—(A) is currently in United States custody; and (B) has been determined by the United States to have been properly detained as an enemy combatant or is awaiting such determination." Military Commissions Act of 2006 (S. 3930). Subsection (e)(2) would deprive courts of "jurisdiction to hear or consider any other action against the United States or its agents relating to any aspect of the detention, transfer, treatment, trial, or conditions of confinement of an alien detained by the United States" who meets these conditions, except as provided in the Detainee Treatment Act of 2005. *Id.* These provisions appear in Section 106 of S. 3929.

² Section 702(b)(1) of that bill currently provides: "In any case before any court challenging the legality of classified communications intelligence activity relating to a foreign threat, including an electronic surveillance program, or in which the legality of any such activity or program is in issue, if the Attorney General files an affidavit under oath that the case should be transferred to the Foreign Intelligence Court of Review because further proceedings in the originating court would harm the national security of the United States, the originating court shall transfer the case to the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court of Review for further proceedings under this subsection." National Security Surveillance Act of 2006 (S. 3876).

decisions would shield the administration's electronic surveillance program from effective and transparent judicial scrutiny.

These bills exhibit a profound and unwarranted distrust of the judiciary. The historic role of the courts is to ensure that the legislature promulgates and the executive faithfully executes the law of the land with due respect for the rights of even the most despised. Any protections embodied in these bills would be rendered worthless unless the courts can hold the executive accountable to enacted law. Moreover, the bills ignore a central teaching of the Supreme Court's decision in *Hamdan v. Rumsfeld*: the importance of shared institutional powers and checks and balances in crafting lawful and sustainable responses to the war on terror. Absent effective judicial review, there will be no way to enforce any of the limitations in either bill that Congress is currently seeking to place upon the executive's claimed power.

We recognize the need to prevent and punish crimes of terrorism and to investigate and prosecute such crimes. But depriving our courts of jurisdiction to determine whether the executive has acted properly when it detains individuals in this effort would endanger the rights of our own soldiers and nationals abroad, by limiting our ability to demand that they be provided the protections that we deny to others. Eliminating effective judicial review of executive acts as significant as detention and domestic surveillance cannot be squared with the principles of transparency and rule of law on which our constitutional democracy rests.

The Congress would gravely disserve our global reputation as a law-abiding country by enacting bills that seek to combat terrorism by stripping judicial review. We respectfully urge you to amend the judicial review provisions of the Military Commissions Act and the National Security Surveillance Act to ensure that the rights granted by those bills will be enforceable and reviewable in a court of law.

Sincerely,³

³ Institutional affiliations are provided for identification purposes only.

James J. Alfini
President and Dean
South Texas College of Law

Michelle J. Anderson
Dean
CUNY School of Law

Katharine T. Bartlett
Dean and A. Kenneth Pye Professor of Law
Duke Law School

Molly K. Beutz
Yale Law School

John Charles Boger, Dean
School of Law, University of North Carolina at
Chapel Hill

Jeffrey S. Brand
Dean, Professor and Chairman, Center for Law
& Global Justice
University of San Francisco Law School

Katherine S. Broderick
Dean and Professor
University of the District of Columbia David
A. Clarke School of Law

Brian Bromberger
Dean and Professor
Loyola Law School

Robert Butkin
Dean and Professor of Law
University of Tulsa College of Law

Bob Butterworth
Dean
St. Thomas University School of Law

Evan Caminker
Dean and Professor of Law
University of Michigan Law School

Harold Hongju Koh
Dean and Gerard C. & Bernice Latrobe Smith
Professor of International Law
Yale Law School

Harold J. Krent
Dean & Professor
Chicago-Kent College of Law

Lydia Pallas Loren
Interim Dean and Professor of Law
Lewis & Clark Law School

Dennis Lynch
Dean, University of Miami School of Law
Richard A. Matasar
President and Dean
New York Law School

Philip J. McConnaughay
Dean and Donald J. Farage Professor of Law
The Pennsylvania State University
Dickinson School of Law

Richard J. Morgan, Dean
William S. Boyd School of Law
University of Nevada, Las Vegas

Fred L. Morrison
Popham Haik Schnobrich/Lindquist &
Vennum Professor of Law and
Interim Co-Dean, University of Minnesota
Law School

Kenneth M. Murchison
James E. & Betty M. Phillips Professor of Law
Louisiana State University Paul M. Hebert
Law Center

Cynthia Nance
Dean and Professor
University of Arkansas, School of Law

Nell Jessup Newton
William B. Lockhart Professor of Law,

Judge John L. Carroll
 Dean and Ethel P. Malugen Professor of Law
 Cumberland School of Law
 Samford University

Neil H. Cogan
 Vice President and Dean
 Whittier Law School

John J. Costonis, Chancellor
 Louisiana State University
 Paul M. Hebert Law Center

Mary Crossley
 Dean and Professor of Law
 University of Pittsburgh School of Law

Mary C. Daly
 Dean & John V. Brennan Professor Law and
 Ethics
 St. John's University School of Law

Stuart L. Deutsch
 Dean and Professor of Law
 Rutgers School of Law-Newark

Stephen Dycus
 Professor, Vermont Law School

Allen K. Easley
 President & Dean
 William Mitchell College of Law

Christopher Edley, Jr.
 Dean and Professor
 Boalt Hall School of Law, UC Berkeley

Cynthia L. Fountaine
 Interim Dean and Professor of Law
 Texas Wesleyan University School of Law

Stephen J. Friedman
 Dean
 Pace University School of Law

Chancellor and Dean
 University of California at Hastings College of
 Law

Maureen A. O'Rourke
 Dean and Professor of Law
 Michaels Faculty Research Scholar
 Boston University School of Law

Margaret L. Paris
 Dean
 Elmer Sahlstrom Senior Fellow
 University of Oregon School of Law

David Partlett
 Dean, Emory Law School.

LeRoy Pernell
 Dean and Professor
 Northern Illinois University
 College of Law

Rex R. Perschbacher
 Dean and Professor of Law
 University of California at Davis School of
 Law

Raymond C. Pierce
 Dean and Professor of Law
 North Carolina Central University
 School of Law

Peter Pitegoff
 Dean & Professor of Law
 University of Maine School of Law

Donald J. Polden, Dean
 School of Law
 Santa Clara University

Efrén Rivera Ramos
 Dean
 School of Law
 University of Puerto Rico

Douglas E. Ray

Dean Bryant G. Garth
Southwestern Law School
Los Angeles, California

Charles W. Goldner, Jr.
Dean and Professor of Law
William H. Bowen School of Law
University of Arkansas at Little Rock

Mark C. Gordon
Dean and Professor of Law
University of Detroit Mercy School of Law

Thomas F. Guernsey
President and Dean
Albany Law School

Don Guter
Dean
Duquesne University School of Law

Jack A. Guttenberg
Dean & Professor of Law
Capital University Law School

Joseph D. Harbaugh
Dean and Professor
Shepard Broad Law Center
Nova Southeastern University

Lawrence K. Hellman
Dean and Professor of Law
Oklahoma City University School of Law

Patrick E. Hobbs
Dean and Professor of Law
Seton Hall University School of Law

Dean Dennis R. Honabach
Chase College of Law
Northern Kentucky University

Joseph Richard Hurt
Dean and Professor of Law
Barry University

Dean and Professor of Law
The University of Toledo College of Law

William J. Rich
Interim Dean and Professor of Law
Washburn University School of Law

Lauren Robel
Dean and Val Nolan Professor
Indiana University School of Law

Karen H. Rothenberg
Dean and Marjorie Cook Professor
University of Maryland School of Law

James V. Rowan
Associate Dean
Northeastern University School of Law
Boston, Massachusetts

Edward Rubin
Dean and John Wade-Kent Syverud Professor
of Law
Vanderbilt University

David Rudenstine
Dean
Cardozo School of Law

Lawrence G. Sager
Dean, University of Texas School of Law
Alice Jane Drysdale Sheffield Regents Chair in
Law

Brad Saxton
Dean & Professor of Law
Quinnipiac University School of Law

Stewart J. Schwab
the Allan R. Tessler Dean & Professor of Law
Cornell Law School

Geoffrey B. Shields
President and Dean and Professor of Law
Vermont Law School

Dwayne O. Andreas School of Law

Craig L. Jackson
Professor of Law
Thurgood Marshall School of Law
Texas Southern University

José Roberto Juárez, Jr.
Dean and Professor of Law
University of Denver Sturm College of Law

W. H. Knight, Jr.
Dean and Professor
University of Washington School of Law
Seattle, Washington

Gary J. Simson
Dean and Joseph C. Hostetler-Baker &
Hostetler Professor of Law
Case Western Reserve University School of
Law

Aviam Soifer
Dean and Professor
William S. Richardson School of Law
University of Hawai'i

Emily A. Spieler
Dean
Edwin Hadley Professor of Law
Northeastern University School of Law

Kurt A. Strasser
Interim Dean and Phillip I. Blumberg Professor
University of Connecticut Law School

Leonard P. Strickman
Dean
Florida International University
College of Law

Aaron D. Twerski
Dean and Professor of Law
Hofstra Law School

Burns H. Weston
Vermont Law School Visiting Distinguished
Professor of International Law &
Policy; Bessie Dutton Murray Distinguished
Professor of Law Emeritus and
Interim Director/Senior Scholar, Center for
Human Rights (UICHR), The
University of Iowa
Vermont Law School

Patricia D. White
Dean
Arizona State University

Steven L. Willborn
Dean & Schmoker Professor of Law
University of Nebraska College of Law

Frank H. Wu
Dean
Wayne State University Law School

David Yellen
Dean and Professor
Loyola University Chicago School of Law